

## **Consultant Evaluation Summary For County Project CP 63-33/4-18**

### **Consultant Services Description:**

County Project (CP) 63-33 is the Delaware Avenue Reconstruction and CP 4-18 is the Butler Avenue Safe Routes to School (SRTS) Improvements. CP 63-33 includes the preliminary and final design, right of way acquisition, and reconstruction of County State Aid Highway (CSAH) 63 (Delaware Avenue) from Marie Avenue to Trunk Highway (TH) 149 (Dodd Road) on the border of Mendota Heights and West St. Paul. CP 4-18 was identified as part of the Dakota County School Travel Safety Assessment and will add trail and sidewalk to County Road (CR) 4 (Butler Avenue) between CSAH 63 and Manomin Avenue in West St. Paul.

### **Scope of Consultant Services:**

The scope of work for County Project 63-33 and 4-18 (hereafter referred to as “the project”) includes public engagement, agency coordination, data collection, traffic analysis, drainage analysis and design, right of way identification and acquisition services, preliminary and final design, and funding application support. The Delaware Avenue reconstruction portion will include roadway modernization, intersection and safety improvements, drainage improvements, and will add separated pedestrian and bicycle infrastructure to the corridor. The Butler Avenue SRTS Improvements will improve safety and accessibility for area students and residents to walk, bike, and roll to St. Joseph’s Catholic School and Heritage STEM Middle School and other nearby destinations.

County and City staff assessed anticipated right of way acquisition needs to complete the project. The project area has constrained existing right of way, and a wide variety of improved properties exist adjacent to the project area. Regular coordination, meetings, and negotiations with over 100 individual property owners from single occupancy homes to the Dodge Nature Center and the Somerset Country Club will be required to secure permanent and temporary easements necessary for construction. County and City staff assessed these potential needs along with the projected Physical Development real estate specialist workload and recommended soliciting for a full scope of right of way acquisition services in conjunction with the preliminary and final design proposals. This approach will ensure right of way acquisition service availability within the project schedule and ensure high quality coordination between the design team, project schedule, and right of way process.

### **Deliverables:**

The contract’s technical deliverables include a quality control plan, a public involvement plan and materials, property owner/stakeholder tracking, topographical survey data, an environmental site assessment, utility coordination, right of way exhibits, appraisals and review, traffic analysis reports and memos, an alternatives analysis/preliminary engineering design memorandum, geotechnical reports, project permitting, preliminary and final plans, specifications and estimates, and a complete bid package. The contract deliverables will also include project management services and public/agency engagement as outlined below.

### **Public and Agency Engagement:**

This project will include efforts to engage with the general public and with agencies, including representatives of the City of Mendota Heights, City of West St. Paul, MnDOT and the public in the project area. Dakota County and the consultant will implement public outreach using direct mailings, flyers, signage, social media, scheduled public open house meetings, online survey and mapping tools, stakeholder meetings, renderings/visualizations, and other communications. The size and complexity of

the project will require a stand-alone web page to house project materials and information in a manner that is well maintained, accessible and digestible for the general public.

**Schedule:**

The contract schedule is planned from June 2024 through at least March 2027. Preliminary and final design, public engagement, and right of way acquisition are scheduled for the remainder of 2024 into mid-2026, with construction in 2027.

**Consultant Selection Summary:**

The Request for Proposals (RFP) for the required consultant services was released on March 29, 2024 and was sent to the following three (3) consultant firms: Bolton & Menk, Kimley-Horn, and TKDA. These three firms were invited to submit proposals because of proven expertise and ability to deliver complex reconstruction projects in similar project areas. Proposals from all three consultants were submitted to the County by the due date of April 24, 2024.

**Review Team and Process:**

The three (3) proposals were reviewed by staff from Dakota County and the Cities of Mendota Heights and West St. Paul, including staff representing experience and expertise in project management, engineering design, right of way acquisition, traffic engineering project management, and bicycle and pedestrian safety. Proposals were reviewed and ranked independently by review team members. The review team members met on May 21, 2024, to discuss the proposals, share information regarding individual member evaluations and reach consensus on a recommended consultant. The consensus reached by the proposal review team supported negotiating a contract with Kimley-Horn.

**Evaluation Criteria:**

The proposals were evaluated and ranked based on the following criteria:

1. Understanding of the Scope of Work (15%) – Understanding of project objectives & scope. Ability to complete work. Overall proposal presentation. Deliverables & attention to main issues raised in RFP and other issues raised not in RFP.
2. Project Approach (30%) – Reasonable proposed approach & methodology. Constraints/risk identification. Schedule & work plan. Estimate of work accuracy & efficiency. Quality & clarity.
3. Project Team and Expertise of Key Personnel (20%) – Personnel/team suitability for project, previous Dakota County/City experiences. Lead firm & consultant design experience. Qualifications & efficiency in resource utilization.
4. Quality Control (15%) – Explanation of how consultant to deliver on project timeline. Work plan presentation, org chart, staffing schedule quality. Quality control summary statement.
5. Past Performance on similar projects (5%) – Previous experience with at least three similar projects & project details. Knowledge of local issues with project, understanding of stakeholder participation. Proven innovative design approaches/techniques.
6. Fee Estimate – fee estimate in relation to the other criteria above, including understanding and explanation of budget priorities and relationships between tasks, special approaches, options for negotiation/amendment, value vs. cost to be provided, and presentation of the fee estimate/breakdown

**Evaluation Results:**

Dakota County and City staff scored the Kimley-Horn proposal highest on average based on the evaluation criteria above. All proposals were evaluated based on this objective and others, to determine whether the work plan, hours, and rate structure were sufficient and reasonable to successfully

complete the required work. Reviewers appreciated the detailed work plan provided in the firm’s proposal, which presented a strong understanding of the key issues and challenges of the project, and provided an integrated approach to delivering all tasks by a qualified team with recent relevant experience on similar projects. The selection team highly valued the Kimley-Horn team’s clearly-displayed project understanding, including a highly-detailed issues map, and approach to the Butler Avenue portion of the project. In particular, the Kimley-Horn proposal provided a detailed and robust approach to preliminary design, public/stakeholder engagement, utility coordination, and right of way acquisition, as well as a detailed schedule with clear milestones identified, all of which will be critical to project success. The Kimley-Horn team also displayed excellent relevant experience on similar projects as well as experience with stakeholders and the nearby community. Staff also agreed with Kimley-Horn’s proposed optional task to add interactive mapping to the public engagement scope, and incorporated those costs and hours into the contract.

**Summary of Proposed costs:**

<b>Consultant</b>	<b>Total Cost</b>	<b>Engineering Cost</b>	<b>Right of Way Cost</b>	<b>Consultant Hours</b>	<b>Cost Per Hour</b>
Bolton & Menk	\$2,123,668	\$1,143,463	\$915,170	7,367	\$155.21
Kimley-Horn	\$1,832,900	\$811,425	\$1,021,475	5,083	\$155.99
TKDA	\$1,790,306	\$869,018	\$921,290	5,404	\$154.43

Note: Cost Per Hour does not include tasks/hours for subconsultants and is based on the proposing consultant’s hours/costs.

Right of way acquisition costs are reported separately from engineering costs. This cost encompasses the full scope of right of way acquisition services including independent appraisals, appraisal review, right of way subconsultant time for correspondence, negotiation, documentation, etc. These costs were comparable across the three proposals and after review, staff finds them reasonable and justified.

**Recommendation:**

Staff recommends the consulting engineering firm Kimley-Horn and Associates Inc. be awarded a contract for County Project 63-33, the County State Aid Highway 63 (Delaware Avenue) Reconstruction and County Project 4-18, the County Road 4 (Butler Avenue) Safe Routes to School Improvements. Given the scope of the needed work and issues to be addressed, the Kimley-Horn proposal, project team, and subconsultants offered the best approach, detailed work plan, previous project experience, and balanced cost-to-value from among the three (3) received proposals.